MEDLEGAL YEAR BOOK





Institute of Medicine & Law Value Driven. Evidence Based.

MedLegal Year Book 2023

Editor-in-Chief

Mahendrakumar Bajpai Advocate, Supreme Court of India

Editor Emeritus

Balaji Srinivasan Advocate-on-Record, Supreme Court of India Senior Partner, The Medlegal Attorneys



Institute of Medicine & Law Value Driven. Evidence Based.

ABOUT THIS YEAR BOOK

The MedLegal Year Book 2023 is in essence, an instruction manual on medical laws for today's busy doctors. The instructions are in the form of simple 'Do's & Don'ts' that can be easily put to use in the day-to-day practice of medicine. It also updates doctors on the new laws and changes in the existing laws that are relevant to them. This book aims to help Indian doctors in avoiding, minimising and/or facing the growing threat of MedLegal issues confidently.

Laws are usually laid down by judgments of the higher courts. Medical Law Cases – For Doctors (MLCD), a monthly law reporter, collects and publishes doctorrelevant judgments, delivered by one Supreme Court, one National Consumer Commission, 35 State Consumer Commissions, and 25 High Courts in India. Each of these judgments has lessons that can be learnt from either the mistakes of doctors, allegations of negligence made by patients, or observations made by courts. These lessons, and at times, even practical experiences of the editorial board, are published as 'Suggested Precautions,' which are the practical do's and don'ts for doctors and hospitals.

All the 'Suggested Precautions' reported in the previous year of MLCD (Volume 15 - 2022) are reproduced under appropriate headings. These 'Suggested Precautions' are further condensed into a one-liner 'Do' or 'Don't'. In some places, a number of 'Suggested Precautions' having the same meaning are regrouped under a particular 'Do' or 'Don't'.

The Indian Medical Council (Professional Conduct, Etiquette, and Ethics) Regulations – 2002 is the statutory law regulating the professional conduct of allopaths in India. Hence, relevant extracts from this regulation are reproduced at appropriate places to make this book complete and easier for cross-referencing.

The MedLegal Year Book is intended to update Indian doctors on the everchanging medical laws. It is hoped that these practically useful and helpful instructions are not only read and understood but also appropriate changes are brought by doctors in their practice.

INDEX

About this Year Book	0
Editorial Board	0
Board of Collaborative Reviewers	0
Abbreviations, Meanings & Tips	0
MedLegal Do's & Don'ts - 2023	0-0
MedLegal Year Book - 2023	0-00
PART I – GENERAL	
1. Precautions — Unusual	0
2. Accidents / Mishaps / Mistakes	00
3. Emergency Patients	00
3.1. Emergency Patients — General Precautions	00
3.1. Emergency Patients - General Precautions	00
3.2. Emergency Patients - Treating / Managing	00
3.3. Emergency Patients - Beyond expertise	00
3.4. Emergency Patients - Hospitals (Precautions)	00
4. Medico Legal Cases	00
4.1. Medico Legal Cases — Postmortem	00
5. Courts and Legal Proceedings	00
5.1. Complications during treatment / intervention	00
5.2. Transferring patients (hospitalized)	00
5.3. Patients Failure / Refusal / Delay to follow medical advice	00
5.4. Terminating / Withdrawing from patient midway	00
5.5. Patients with communicable / notifiable diseases / epidemics	00
5.6. Appointing substitutes / on-call physicians / locums	00
5.7. Violence by Patients / Attendants	00
5.8. Managed Health Care	00
6. Courts / Legal Proceedings	00
6.1. Courts / Legal Proceedings — General Precautions	00
7. Consent	00
7.1. Consent - General Precautions	00
7.2. Consent - Form	00
7.3. Consent - Risk information	00
7.4. Consent - Emergencies	00

	7.5. Consent - Surgeries / Procedures / Interventions	00
	7.6. Consent - Alternative / Extension during interventions	00
	7.7. Consent - Blood transfusion	00
	7.8. Consent - Refusal to consent / Compulsory treatment	00
8. Con	fidentiality	. 00
	8.1. Confidentiality - General Precautions	00
	8.2. Confidentiality - HIV/AIDS patients	00
	8.3. Confidentiality - Exceptions	00
9. Prec	autions - General	.00
	9.1. Precautions - General Precautions	00
	9.2. "Accepted Medical Practice"	00
	9.3. Qualifications / Expertise / Skills	00
	9.4. Fees	00
	9.5. Patients history	00
	9.6. Examining patients	00
	9.7. Advising investigations / diagnostic procedures	00
	9.8. Collecting samples for investigations / diagnostic procedures	00
	9.9. Diagnosis	00
	9.10. Treating / Managing patients	00
	9.11. Prescription	00
	9.12. Drugs / Implants	00
	9.13. Blood Transfusion	00
	9.14. Referral / consultations / second opinion - Precautions for referring doctors	00
	9.15. Referral / consultations / second opinion - Precautions for referred doctors	00
	9.16. Communication with patients / attendants	00
	9.17. Professional colleagues / peers	00
	9.18. Updating knowledge / Continuing Medical Education (CME)	00
	9.19. Advertisement / Signboards / Soliciting Patients	00
	9.20. Statutory compliance	00
	9.21. Insurance	00
	9.22. Tele-medicine	00
	9.23. Ambulance	00

PART II - DOCUMENTATION & MEDICAL RECORDS

10. Documentation	00
10.1. Documentation - General Precautions	00
10.2. Documentation - Incident Reporting	00
11. Medical Records	00
11.1. Medical Records - General Precautions	00
11.2. Medical Records - Internal / External	00

11.3. Medical Records - Surgeries / Procedures / Interventions	00
11.4. Medical Records - Hospitals	00
11.5. Medical Records - Bed-head tickets	00
11.6. Medical Records - Discharge cards / summaries	00
11.7. Medical Records - Preserve / Provide / Produce	00
11.8. Medical Records - Electronic / Computerized	00
12. Certificates	00
12.1. Certificates — Fitness (after leave / to resume)	

PART III – SURGERY / PROCEDURE / INTERVENTIONS

13. Surgery / Procedure / Intervention	00
13.1. Surgery / Procedure / Intervention - General Precautions	.00
13.2. Surgery / Procedure / Intervention - Pre	.00
13.3. Surgery / Procedure / Intervention - Intra	.00
13.4. Surgery / Procedure / Intervention - Post	.00
13.5. Surgery / Procedure / Intervention - Alternative / Extension	.00
13.6. Surgery / Procedure / Intervention - Anesthesia	.00

PART IV - INSTITUTIONS / FACILITIES

14. Hospitals	
14.1. Hospitals - General Precautions	00
14.2. Hospitals - Admitting patients	00
14.3. Hospitals - Discharging patients	00
14.4. Hospitals - Discharge / Leave Against Medical Advice (DAMA / LAN	ЛА)00
14.5. Hospitals - Patients care	00
14.6. Hospitals - RMOs / Consultants	00
14.7. Hospitals - Nursing / Staff	00
14.8. Hospitals - Infrastructure / Equipment	00
14.9. Hospitals - Operation Theatres	00
14.10. Hospitals - Intensive Care Units	00
14.11. Hospitals - Infections	00
14.12. Hospitals - Sterilization	00
15. Pathology Laboratories / Imaging Centers	00
16. Blood Banks	00
17. Maternity Hospitals / Wards	00

PART V – LAW ON MEDICAL NEGLIGENCE

18. Lav	w on Medical	Negligence	
±0. Ea	. on meanear		

Abbreviations

HPE:	Histopathological examination
ICCU:	Intensive Cardiac Care Unit
ICU:	Intensive Care Unit
IMCR, 2002:	Indian Medical Council (Professional Conduct, Etiquette, and Ethics) Regulations, 2002
IPD:	In-Patient Department
MCI:	Medical Council of India
MTP:	Medical Termination of Pregnancy
OPD:	Out-Patient Department
OT:	Operation Theatre

Meanings

attendants:

means and includes relatives / friends

means and includes leave against medical advice (LAMA)
means and includes discharge card / discharge certificate
/ discharge note / discharge ticket
means and includes nursing homes / day care clinics
means and includes surgeries / procedures
means and includes diagnostic procedures
means and includes accidents
means and includes reference note / reference summary
means and includes transfer card / transfer note
means the doctor / hospitals (reader)

Tips

- 1. "/" between two words or phrases is used in lieu of "and", "or", "and/or".
- 2. 'Advisable' in Do's & Don'ts means it is not mandatory in nature or statutorily prescribed yet desirable in the opinion of the editorial board.
- 3. 'Advisable' after the second sentence in Do's & Don'ts means that only the second sentence is not legally mandatory in nature whereas the first sentence is mandatory.
- 4. Individual doctors must also refer to the following topics from Chapter 12. Hospitals as they are relevant to individual practitioners also:

12.2. Hospitals — Admitting patients

- 12.3. Hospitals Discharging patients
- 12.4. Hospitals Discharge against medical advice

MedLegal Do's & Don'ts - 2023

PART I – GENERAL

1. Precautions — Unusual

	Take into account while delivering healthcare services - "Charter of Patient's Rights" framed by the National Human Rights Commission00
\checkmark	Let the patient choose the facility for performing investigations00
V	 In case you recommend an investigation facility to a patient - Ensure / confirm it's quality / availability / timings / so on00 Patients under regular care / follow-up at a hospital / nursing home, such as pregnant patients under ANC - Refuse admission only for solid justifications00
\checkmark	Pregnant patients00
	 Provide appropriate antenatal care (ANC)00 Prepare / maintain ANC card - Document requisite parameters of each follow-up visit00 Hospitals - Patients Grievance Redressal Mechanism00
$\overline{\checkmark}$	 Have appropriate protocols to take cognizance of and promptly attend to patients grievances
	accidents / mishaps00
	Show genuine empathy towards patients / attendants who are victims of medical negligence00
V	Make efforts / systemic improvements in administration to improve patient safety00
V	Take greater care / caution / contemplation in case you decide to wait and watch (doctrine of masterly inactivity)00
	Take special efforts to explain anomalies / surprises to the patient / attendants as and when they occur00
	Do not insist that patient should buy medicines only from a particular shop - Inform to get them from any standard shop of his/her choice00
\checkmark	Write correct name of the patient in medical records00
\checkmark	Hospitalized patients / attendants insisting to purchase their own medicines / implants00

	 Take such requests in writing from patient / attendants00 Document this fact specifically in medical records00 Contemplate before00
	Offering free / subsidized treatment to the patient.Assuring to pay for the treatment elsewhere, especially
\checkmark	after a mishap00 Precautions for non-therapeutic medical specialities such as dermatologists / cosmetologists:00
	 Proper communications
\checkmark	Proper documentation00 OT notes00
	 Record details of the intervention clearly / concisely / to the point
\checkmark	Be careful in taking a thumb impression on the consent form, especially if the patient / attendant is literate00
\checkmark	Before making statements before authorities / police / Medical Councils00
	 Take care / contemplate
	• Advisable - Take assistance from legal professionals00 Record specifically all instances where a patient refuses / fails / expresses inability to follow medical advice, even if it is due to financial constraints00
\times	Do not raise false bills to claim higher insurance claims00
Ø	Give patient enough time to contemplate / take a decision after advising any intervention - Emergencies are exceptions00
	Any insistence / request from patient / attendants to rush through the surgery00
V	 Take in writing
\checkmark	Record specifically if the patient has consulted other doctors / hospitals00

х

PART I – GENERAL

1. Precautions — Unusual

VVV & XXX

- Take into account while delivering healthcare services "Charter of Patient's Rights" framed by the National Human Rights Commission.
- Take greater care / caution / contemplation in case you decide to wait and watch (doctrine of masterly inactivity).
- Do not insist that patient should buy medicines only from a particular shop - Inform to get them from any standard shop of his/her choice.
- Be careful in taking a thumb impression on the consent form, especially if the patient / attendant is literate.
- Advisable Allot a single file / ID no to every patient although the patient may be visiting OPD of different specialities.
- 'Group Practice'
 - Inform the patient specifically about this arrangement at the outset.
 - Take their assent, preferably in writing.
 - Medical societies / regulator (National Medical Commission) -Prepare appropriate protocols regarding 'group practice'.
- Professional Bodies / Medical Societies
 - Ensure that medical protocols are clear / uniform.
- **Do not associate with unqualified and unscrupulous persons / facilities.**
- ✓ Take into account while delivering healthcare services "Charter of Patient's Rights" framed by the National Human Rights Commission.

Doctors and hospitals must take into account the "Charter of Patient's Rights" framed by the National Human Rights Commission while delivering healthcare services. Although this Charter does not have any force of law, nevertheless it comes from an important Institution and every attempt must be made to follow it in letter and spirit. (In this case, the court while holding the hospital (OP) deficient in service for not providing medical records to the patient within the stipulated period has referred to this Charter also.)

Gujarat Consumer Protection Council & Anr. v/s Medical Superintendent, V. S. Hospital & Anr. [15MLCD (j9)]

1

 $\overline{\mathbf{A}}$

Let the patient choose the facility for performing investigations. In case you recommend an investigation facility to a patient - Ensure / confirm it's quality / availability / timings / so on.

> When an investigation is advised, it is better to leave the choice of the laboratory to the patient but if you recommend a facility then you have to be sure of its quality, timing, availability and so on. (In this case, it was alleged that the surgeon (OP) advised a centre for USG that was about 30 km away. By the time the pregnant patient reached it was closed and when the patients husband called the surgeon (OP), he replied "what can I do?" USG was performed on the next day and it reported intrauterine foetal death. The court did not comment about the same but such incidents should be avoided at all costs.)

> Gagandeep v/s Chunni Lal Memorial Gulati Hospital & Ors. [15MLCD (j24)]

✓ Patients under regular care / follow-up at a hospital / nursing home, such as pregnant patients under ANC - Refuse admission only for solid justifications.

> Hospitals / nursing homes have all the right to outrightly refuse to admit a patient. But in the case of patients under regular care and follow-up at the hospital, as in the case of pregnant patients who take ante-natal care, refusing to admit for delivery or when the patient faces complications requires solid justifications. (In this case, it was alleged that the hospital (OP) where the patient was taking antenatal care, refused to hospitalize her after intrauterine foetal death was diagnosed and she had to get hospitalized in another hospital. The court did not comment on this allegation.)

> Gagandeep v/s Chunni Lal Memorial Gulati Hospital & Ors. [15MLCD (j24)]

Pregnant patients

- Provide appropriate antenatal care (ANC).
- Prepare / maintain ANC card Document requisite parameters of each follow-up visit.

In any pregnancy, antenatal care (ANC) and ANC card play an important role in identifying impending complications and managing the same. An ANC card must be maintained appropriately documenting all the parameters at each follow-up, preserved with medical records, and produced in court if required. The court, in this case where the patient with preeclampsia had an intrauterine

4

foetal death, has made a lengthy observation on the importance of ANC. The court drew an adverse inference against the hospital and doctors (OPs) for failure to produce the ANC card in court.

Gagandeep v/s Chunni Lal Memorial Gulati Hospital & Ors. [15MLCD (j24)]

Hospitals - Patients Grievance Redressal Mechanism

- Have appropriate protocols to take cognizance of and promptly attend to patients grievances.
- Inform patient / attendants of the measures taken.
- Duly record the same.

 $\overline{\mathbf{N}}$

Hospitals / doctors must have appropriate protocols in place to take cognizance of and promptly attend to patients grievances. The patient / attendants must be informed of the measures taken and the same must also be documented. (In this case, the patient had a fall from the wheelchair in the hospital premises while on a followup visit. The patient alleged in court that although this incident was informed to the hospital (OP) authorities yet no measures were taken to address the patient's grievances. The court commented that hospital authorities should make systemic improvement in "their grievance redressal mechanism to ensure the patient's safety and to maintain good doctor-patient relationship.")

Director Administration, P.D. Hinduja National Hospital & Medical Research Centre v/s Harsha Ashok Lala [15MLCD (j51)]

- Have appropriate protocols / take proper efforts to avoid accidents / mishaps.
 - Show genuine empathy towards patients / attendants who are victims of medical negligence.

Accidents / mishaps are unavoidable but appropriate protocols / efforts must be in place to avoid them. The least that is expected by the patient / attendants from doctors / hospital authorities is genuine empathy and it can make a big difference in the way the situation unfolds further. This case is an excellent illustration of the aforesaid. The patient admittedly fell from the wheelchair and injured her ankle while she was being wheeled into the hospital (OP) by security personnel. Two pointed allegations made in the court, "made to stand in queue for payment of x-ray charges" and "immediate first aid was not given" clearly indicate that the situation worsened due to lack of empathy that ought to have been shown by the hospital (OP) authorities at the outset.

3